

EFFECTIVENESS OF THE RELIGIOUS HARMONY GUIDANCE PROGRAM IN WEST JAVA

Luthfi Anwar Mahbubi

UIN Sunan Gunung Djati Bandung, Indonesia

luthfianwar08@gmail.com

Abstract

The religious harmony guidance program carried out by the Legal and Religious Subdivision of the Regional Office of the Ministry of Religion of West Java Province is intended to create peace and harmonious relations between religious communities. Ironically, the research of the religious harmony index by the Ministry of Religion in 2019 shows that West Java ranks third with the lowest score in Indonesia. The purpose of this study was to determine the effectiveness implementation of religious harmony guidance program for Religious Affairs and Religious Affairs Subdivision Regional Office of the Ministry of Religion of West Java. This study uses the Nugroho Policy Effectiveness theory with five precise indicators, namely: 1) right policy; 2) proper implementers; 3) right on target; 4) appropriate environment; and 5) proper process. This research uses a qualitative approach with a descriptive method to address the issues examined by collecting data through observations, interviews, and documentation. The results of this study indicate that the implementation of religious harmony guidance program Legal Subdivision and Religious Harmony The Regional Office of the Ministry of Religion of West Java Province has not all been effective based on the five right policies, namely the right policies, implementers, the right target, the right environment, and the right process.

Keywords: *Effectiveness, Program, Religious Harmony*

1. INTRODUCTION

Based on data from the Central Bureau of Statistics West Java in 2019, it shows that West Java Province has a population of nearly 50 million people supported by high immigration rates, making it the province with the largest population in Indonesia. This has implications for the high level of ethnic, racial, cultural, and religious diversity which does not cause a few conflicts, one of which is in terms of religious harmony. The conflict can be in the form of violations of freedom of belief arising on the basis of intolerance. Intolerance can threaten the unity and unity of the nation.

The problem of intolerance that occurs in several regions, especially in West Java, needs serious attention. The prevention of intolerance in West Java is carried out through the implementation of a guidance program for religious harmony in the Subdivision of Law and Religious Harmony at the Regional Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs of West Java Province. This is a form of implementation of the mandate of article 364 paragraph 3 of the Regulation of the Minister of Religious Affairs (PMA) No. 13 of 2012 concerning the Organization and Work Procedures of Vertical Agencies of the Ministry of Religious Affairs, the Subdivision of Law and Religious Harmony which has the task of preparing materials for the preparation of laws and regulations and legal assistance, implementing guidance for religious harmony, and Khonghucu community services.

Based on data, West Java Province received a religious harmony index score of 68.5, followed by West Sumatra and Aceh Provinces as the 3rd lowest province in Indonesia. This gain is reinforced by the many cases of violations in religious matters of a group of people in West Java Province. Some examples of violations that occurred in West Java such as in Bogor, the Indonesian Christian Church (GKI) Yasmin Bogor which until now did not get the right to worship in a proper location, so dozens of church members held Sunday services on the road opposite the State Palace since 2011 due to the sealing of the church carried out by a group of people who considered that the construction of the church was illegal (bbc.com, 11/12/19).

The same thing is also felt by Hindus in Bekasi Regency. The plan to build a temple in Sukahurip Village was rejected by a group of people, even though Hindus there claimed to have fulfilled the requirements for the establishment of a house of worship, especially until now there has not been one temple in Bekasi Regency with the number of Hindus around 7,000 people (bbc.com, 9/5/19). Cases of intolerance also occurred in Garut, West Java related to the burning of the tawhid flag that occurred during the commemoration of Santri Day, causing reactions from Indonesian Muslims in other regions (detik.com, 9/11/18). The incident has been legally processed by designating F and M as flag burners and Uus Sukmana flag bearers who were proven to violate Article 174 of the Criminal Code.

The implementation of the religious harmony guidance program of the Subdivision of Law and Religious Harmony of the Regional Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs of West Java Province should be a solution to the rampant cases of religious intolerance and harmony. Based on the above reality, testing of a program must be carried out to assess the extent of the effectiveness of the program. Mahmudi (2019: 86) defines effectiveness as the relationship between output and goals, the greater the contribution (contribution) of output to the achievement of goals, the more effective the organization, program, or activity. Meanwhile, Martin et al. (2014: 15) define program effectiveness as an assessment of the extent to which a program affects targeted outcomes. Nugroho (2014: 686-689) suggests five right things that need to be met in terms of policy effectiveness, namely:

1. Proper policy

The accuracy of this policy is assessed from the extent to which existing policies have contained things that indeed solve the problem to be solved. Then whether the policy has been formulated in accordance with the character of the problem to be solved, and then whether the policy is made by an institution that has the authority in accordance with the character of the policy.

2. Proper executor

The accuracy of implementation refers to three policy implementation actors, namely the government, public-public/private cooperation, or privatized policy implementation.

3. Right on target

The accuracy of the target can be known through the target that is intervened as planned. First, whether there is no overlap with other interventions. Second, whether the target is ready for intervention or not. Third, whether the implementation intervention is new or updates the implementation of previous policies.

4. Proper environment

There are two most decisive environments, namely the policy environment and the policy external environment consisting of public opinion.

5. Proper Process

Appropriate processes are related to processes in the implementation of public policies including policy acceptance, policy adoption, and strategic readiness.

The religious harmony guidance program is a program derived in the form of activities to educate the public about the importance of maintaining and fostering harmony both between internal religious and inter-religious relations. So to measure its effectiveness, it is necessary to consider several aspects, including the government as the organizer of the activity, related institutions that collaborate in the implementation of religious harmony guidance programs, and the communities targeted in the program. The right policy, the right implementation, and the right process measure the extent of the effectiveness and readiness of the government in implementing the program. Appropriate environment measures the extent of the effectiveness of government collaboration with related institutions. Right target measures the extent of community effectiveness as recipients or targets of the program. The "five appropriates" can describe the various elements involved in the implementation of religious harmony guidance programs, starting with the government, related institutions, and the community. If all these aspects are fulfilled, the community will better understand and understand the importance of religious tolerance and harmony, so that cases related to religious intolerance and disharmony can be minimized.

Based on the background mentioned above, researchers are encouraged to analyze the Effectiveness of the Religious Harmony Guidance Program Subdivision of Law and Religious Harmony at the Regional Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs of West Java in 2019.

2. IMPLEMENTATION METHOD

This research uses a qualitative approach with a descriptive method, the aim is to describe information systematically, factually, and accurately related to the facts in the field regarding the effectiveness of the religious harmony guidance program Subdivision of Law and Religious Harmony Regional Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs of West Java Province in 2019. The data sources used are primary data and secondary data. The data collection techniques used were observation, interviews and documentation. Observations were made by direct observation at the Regional Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs of West Java Province. The informants in this study were selected by purposive sampling based on their fields and capacities, namely the Head of the Subdivision of Law and Religious Harmony of the Regional Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs of West Java Province, the Religious Harmony Analyst of the Regional Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs of West Java Province, and the Chairman of the Forum for Religious Harmony of West Java Province, as well as several religious figures, namely Christian religious figures, Hindu religious figures and Khonghucu religious figures. Documentation in the form of files, writings, images and interview recordings. Data analysis techniques used by researchers in this study is to use the Miles and Huberman model including data reduction, data presentation, and conclusions. The data validity technique used is source triangulation.

3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

This The religious harmony guidance program implemented by the Subdivision of Law and Religious Harmony of the Regional Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs of West Java Province when viewed from the aspect of policy effectiveness based on the theory of five right that must be met in terms of policy effectiveness, includes the right policy, right implementer, right target, right environment and right process as follows:

3.1 Proper Policy

3.1.1 Policies can solve problems

Regulation of the Minister of Religious Affairs (PMA) No. 13 of 2012 concerning Organization and Work Procedures of Vertical Agencies of the Ministry of Religious Affairs has not been able to fully solve the existing problems. The community needs a more comprehensive policy related to harmony. In accordance with the statement of the Head of the Subdivision of Law and Religious Harmony of the Regional Office of the Ministry of Religion of West Java Province, Haidar Yamin Mustafa, SH., MM. says as follows:

"There is no specific policy governing harmony. In fact, the regulation on harmony is still very limited, and the most noticeable is the new Joint Ministerial Regulation (PBM) Number 8 Number 9 of 2006, the regulation only regulates the duties and authorities of local governments in maintaining harmony and the establishment of houses of worship" (Results of an interview on March 4, 2020).

In line with the statement above, Religious Harmony Analyst of the Regional Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs of West Java Province, H. Muhamad Rifa'i stated as follows:

"The legal force of the policy that regulates religious harmony is the only regulation that is owned. The Joint Ministerial Regulation is still considered not strong, because it was only agreed upon by the Minister of Religious Affairs and the Minister of Home Affairs." (Interview results dated March 5, 2020).

Regulatory limitations related to religious harmony guidance programs are indeed obstacles that must be faced. Therefore, the Head of the Subdivision of Law and Religious Harmony is required to be more creative in developing guidance for religious harmony. Meanwhile, Christian religious leader Herlina, S.Th. said firmly when asked whether the existing policy had solved the problem or not as follows:

"Not fully resolved" (Interview results dated May 12, 2020).

One of the factors that causes the policy has not resolved existing problems is related to deficiencies in the organizational hierarchy, as stated by the Chairman of the West Java Province Religious Harmony Forum (FKUB), Drs. H. M. Rafani Achyar M.Si. stated as follows:

"I see that there is still a lack of organizational hierarchy in the PBM regulation" (Interview results on March 6, 2020)

Based on the opinions of some of the informants mentioned above, it can be seen that the policy on religious harmony guidance programs is considered less than optimal, this is because there are no other policies that regulate religious harmony guidance. Supporting regulations are needed to clarify and as a reference in its implementation.

3 1.2. Policies are formulated according to the problem

The problem of religious harmony can be improved through increasing the role of the Ministry of Religious Affairs in various aspects, namely; counseling, facilitation, and coaching. The role of the Ministry of Religious Affairs in carrying out guidance has the highest role. So that the implementation of religious guidance programs is very appropriate as a solution that can solve existing problems in addition to providing facilities and counseling. This policy is basically in accordance with the characteristics of harmony problems in West Java, most of which come from the issue of establishing houses of worship of a group of religious believers. In accordance with the statement of the Head of the Subdivision of Law and Religious Harmony of the Regional Office of the Ministry of Religion of West Java Province, Haidar Yamin Mustafa, SH., MM. He stated as follows:

"The most noticeable policy of the Ministry of Religious Affairs is the involvement of the Ministry of Religious Affairs at the district / city level in the series of issuance of house of worship permits. This is one point when many problems or conflicts that occur in the community are caused by a lack of understanding about the establishment of houses of worship" (Interview results on March 4, 2020).

The regulation has involved the district and city Ministry of Religious Affairs as an extension of the Regional Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs which deals with problems in the regions. The Ministry of Religious Affairs in this case as a recommender will then be forwarded to the district or city government authorized to issue building permits (IMB). Before the policy related to the guidance program was born, there was a Joint Regulation of the Minister of Religious Affairs and the Minister of Home Affairs which had gone through a long process and involved many parties in this matter was official religious assemblies in Indonesia. Chairman of the Forum for Religious Harmony (FKUB) of West Java Province, Drs. H. M. Rafani Achyar M.Si. stated as follows:

"Of course, PBM is the result of a long study. PBM is the result of an agreement of religious assemblies. Islam is represented by MUI (Indonesian Ulema Council), Christianity is represented by PGI (Communion of Churches in Indonesia), Khatolik is represented by the Diocese, Hinduism by Parisada, Buddhism by WALUBI (Indonesian Buddhist Representative), Khonghucu by MATAKIN (Indonesian Khonghucu Religious Council). The religious assemblies convened and

deliberated so as to give birth to an agreement, then stated in PBM." (Interview results dated March 6, 2020).

The statement is in line with what was stated by the Religious Harmony Analyst of the Regional Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs of West Java Province, H. Muhammad Rifa'i as follows:

"The process before the Joint Ministerial Regulation (PBM) was initiated by an agreement of religious leaders, community leaders, women leaders, and youth leaders in 1997/1998 who committed to forming a media or body from the representation of five religions. The result of the agreement was the formation of religious assemblies. The Religious Harmony Forum was born in 2004. A year later the religious assemblies reconvened to submit a draft regulation on religious harmony." (Interview results dated March 5, 2020).

According to the researcher, the policy related to religious harmony was made based on the characteristics of the existing problem and the results of the long thought process of official religious assemblies in Indonesia. This policy answers public unrest in the implementation of religious life, especially in terms of relations between religious people, so that the policy is appropriate.

3.1.3 Policy-making institutions

Regulation of the Minister of Religious Affairs (PMA) No. 13 of 2012 concerning Organization and Work Procedures of Vertical Agencies of the Ministry of Religious Affairs has been made by the appropriate institution, namely the Ministry of Religious Affairs. This is in accordance with the statement of the Head of the Subdivision of Law and Religious Harmony of the Regional Office of the Ministry of Religion of West Java Province, Haidar Yamin Mustafa, SH., MM. says as follows:

"It is correct, but in it has not regulated broadly how a pattern of resolving harmony conflicts, religious conflicts, or social conflicts we do not have a clear agreement. But in principle, we leave it to the surrounding residents, to the people in conflict to find their own middle way, because we are only mediators" (Results of the interview on March 4, 2020).

When viewed from the statement of the Head of the Subdivision of Law and KUB, PMA No. 13 of 2012 only contains instructions to the Subdivision of Law and Religious Harmony related to duties in general only. However, related to the explanation of tupoksi, roadmap, and even SOP program does not exist. This is an important note that must be addressed in the future by the Ministry of Religious Affairs, so that the achievements in its implementation become clear and more focused.

3.2 Proper Executor

The implementation of the religious harmony guidance program implemented by the Regional Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs of West Java Province involves various parties and different agencies. In order to create synergy, it must first be known who are the actors of this religious harmony guidance program. Head of the Subdivision of Law and Religious Harmony of the Regional Office of the Ministry of Religion of West Java Province, Haidar Yamin Mustafa, SH., MM. says that:

"The religious harmony program is the authority and responsibility of the General Secretariat within the Ministry of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia. Meanwhile, the Regional Office of the Provincial Ministry of Religious Affairs is the authority of the Administration Section. However, for West Java we try to include the responsibility of religious harmony in several other fields, such as Islamic Education and Madrasah Education. We try to transmit the values of harmony to students, so that the value of harmony is fostered from an early age, multicultural understanding, and most importantly an understanding of national insight. Even religious counselors in districts / cities have eight categories that serve the community. Of the eight categories of extension workers, one of them is solving problems related to religious harmony" (Interview results on March 4, 2020).

Based on the hierarchy in implementing the policy program, the responsibility is tiered, starting from the central level of the Ministry of Religious Affairs through its Directorate General, then to the province through the Administration Sector and specifically handed down to the Subdivision of Law and Religious Harmony, then down to districts / cities with the distribution of religious extension workers in each sub-district with a total number of 8 extension workers, one of which has a specialization Especially in the field of religious harmony.

The Ministry of Religious Affairs collaborates with the Regional Government and FKUB as agencies mandated by the Joint Ministerial Regulation in maintaining Religious Harmony in the regions. In line with the statement of the Analyst of Religious Harmony at the Regional Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs of West Java Province, H. Muhamad Rifa'i emphasized as follows:

"We, as the Subdivision of Law and Religious Harmony, are not state organizers, but part of state organizers. The Ministry of Religious Affairs is part of the state administration and guidance. And what is mandated by the Regulation of the Minister of Religious Affairs Number 13 of 2012 to the Subdivision of Law and Religious Harmony of the Regional Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs of West Java Province is indeed a task related to the guidance of religious harmony. Our programs in maintaining religious harmony include through the guidance program for religious harmony at the district / city level in inputting and inventorying various problems in 27 districts / cities in West Java with varied problems" (Interview results on March 5, 2020).

One of the implementers in the field is a religious counselor. Khonghucu religious leader who is also a non-civil servant religious counselor, Fam Kiun Fat stated that:

"I am a non-civil servant religious counselor. We are usually trained and given counseling about religious harmony. After providing counseling to religious leaders, then the religious leaders socialized to each community" (Results of an interview on May 11, 2020).

He also added the following:

"The Ministry of Religion does not directly to the community, the Ministry of Religion builds to its religious leaders, religious leaders convey it to each community. So not all communities are fostered by the Ministry of Religion, but religious leaders will be required to socialize to the community in matters such as preaching" (Results of an interview on May 11, 2020).

Based on the results of the interview, it can be seen that the implementers of the Religious Harmony Guidance Program also involve the role of religious extension workers who spearhead the succession of this program, because they are the ones who are directly involved in the community and convince the community about harmony and tolerance. During 2019 the Subdivision of Law and Religious Harmony of the Regional Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs of West Java Province has carried out various activities, including:

- 1) Conducting interfaith dialogue in 27 regencies/cities in West Java
- 2) Conducting harmony dialogue in 20 sub-districts throughout West Java
- 3) Holding interfaith youth camps;
- 4) Carry out the development of religious harmony actors;
- 5) Disseminate the development of multicultural insights;
- 6) The campaign of living in harmony;
- 7) Socialization and establishment of harmony aware villages in 5 villages, namely: Lagadar Village, Bandung Regency, Pangalengan Village, Bandung Regency, Village Cipatujah Tasikmalaya Regency, Kertajaya Village, Ciamis Regency and Ciautumn Village, Kuningan Regency.

3.3 Right on Target

The accuracy of the target is related to several things, including whether the target is in accordance with what is planned, then whether the target is ready for intervention or not, then whether the target condition is in a state of support or rejection. Head of the Subdivision of Law and Religious Harmony of the Regional Office of the Ministry of Religion of West Java Province, Haidar Yamin Mustafa, SH., MM. says as follows:

"Regarding the target in 2019, because of adequate budget support, thank God we were able to enter the school environment, to Islamic boarding schools, teachers, community leaders, religious counselors, and even we also had a dialogue with students" (The results of the interview on March 4, 2020).

Based on the results of the interview mentioned above, it can be seen that the target in the intervention has been as planned. The biggest factor that led to the realization of the program was due to sufficient budget. Thus, in carrying out the religious harmony guidance program, the implementers can touch all groups who are the target of the program, namely students and teachers in various schools and Islamic boarding schools, religious leaders in the community, religious counselors as actors who play an active role in conducting counseling to the community, even to students as agents of change.

Program achievements can be seen based on program indicators, as for indicators of religious harmony guidance programs, namely organizing activities and delivering materials related to religious harmony. Head of the Subdivision of Law and Religious Harmony of the Regional Office of the Ministry of Religion of West Java Province, Haidar Yamin Mustafa, SH., MM. says as follows:

"The harmony materials that have been delivered include understanding awareness of potential conflicts, how to explore religious harmony, both internal and inter-religious, linking the value of harmony with the tourism and business sectors, and providing further understanding of religious and belief issues" (Results of an interview on March 4, 2020).

There are two target groups of readiness for intervention. First, the group that is ready to accept intervention, that is, a society that is open to understanding. This group considers that it is very important to have guidance for religious harmony. Conflict can happen to anyone and any group. Second, groups of people who have an understanding tend to refuse to intervene. This group considers that No guidance was carried out nor was their environment safe and there was no conflict whatsoever.

One example of an open community with this program is based on the statement of a Hindu religious figure, Drs. I Nengah Kondra, M.M.Pd conveyed the following:

"Our response as Hindus is certainly in accordance with the concept of Tat Twam Asi. We must always get along well with government programs. The government in this case is the Regional Government to form religious harmony. Every religious community must follow the program. By participating in the program, it is inevitable that we Hindus have never had problems with anyone, any organization, or with government regulations and hopefully so on" (Interview results on May 11, 2020).

Chairman of the Religious Harmony Forum (FKUB) of West Java Province, Drs. H. M. Rafani Achyar M.Si. added that regarding the target group of the program with open understanding, he said as follows:

"Target has a proper understanding of the importance of harmony or living in harmony. Then after having the right understanding they will have an attitude that is as expected. That attitude will escalate into action." (Interview results dated March 6, 2020).

Based on the results of the interview above, it can be seen that the target of the religious harmony program is in accordance with the readiness to intervene, but there are still people who have not openly accepted. This is influenced by the factor of people's incomprehension.

3.4 Proper Environment

Precisely the environment is influenced by two types of environments, first is the policy environment which is related to the interaction between policy-making agencies and policy implementers with other related institutions. The second is the external environment of the policy which relates to public perception of policy and policy implementation.

Regarding the policy environment, the Chairman of the Religious Harmony Forum (FKUB) of West Java Province, Drs. H. M. Rafani Achyar M.Si. explained related to coordination between FKUB and the Regional Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs of West Java Province as the policy implementing agency as follows:

"The FKUB of West Java has good coordination with the Regional Office, because we receive financial assistance every year from the Ministry of Religious Affairs between 40 and 50 million. With this assistance, our coordination becomes synergy. If there are problems like this, the regional office may not necessarily be able to and it is delegated to us" (Interview results on March 6, 2020).

In line with the above statement, Khonghucu religious leader Fam Kiun Fat stated as follows:

"Usually, the Ministry of Religion holds socialization about the joint decision of two ministers on the establishment of houses of worship. The MORA usually cooperates with FKUBs. In 2018 Bandung City has been rated as one of the most tolerant cities. The award is the result of collaboration between the Ministry of Religion and FKUB to reduce the community from conflict" (Results of an interview on May 11, 2020).

Based on the results of the interview, it can be seen that good communication has been established between the Regional Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs of West Java Province and the Forum for Religious Harmony (FKUB) of West Java Province. Good communication is evidenced by the provision of financial assistance to the FKUB of West Java Province and in terms of solving problems of religious harmony. Coordination is also seen in the process of providing recommendations related to the establishment of houses of worship. Analyst of Religious Harmony at the Regional Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs of West Java Province, H. Muhamad Rifa'i added as follows:

"For religions facilitated by the state to establish houses of worship, they must meet the administrative requirements submitted to the FKUB, then the FKUB provides a copy to us (Kanwil), the Ministry of Religious Affairs also issues as a basic reinforcement of the FKUB

issuing recommendations, then we submit it to local governments to be given IMB" (Interview results on March 6, 2020).

Second is the external environment of the policy. This environment discusses public perception of policy and policy implementation. The public's perspective will be directed to the recipients of religious harmony guidance. Head of the Subdivision of Law and Religious Harmony of the Regional Office of the Ministry of Religion of West Java Province, Haidar Yamin Mustafa, SH., MM. reveals as follows:

"Positive perceptions can be seen from the response of people who want to return to the religious harmony guidance program, because they get updated information related to religious harmony problems and how to solve them. In fact, almost all communities or audiences who dialogue with them are open" (Interview results on March 4, 2020).

As the results of the interview above, it can be seen that the religious harmony guidance program is supported by a good external environment where the community response is enthusiastic about the religious harmony guidance program by the Regional Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs of West Java Province.

3.5 Proper Process

The right process can be assessed from three processes in the implementation of public policy, including: policy acceptance, which is a state where the public understands policy as a rule that is needed for the future and the government understands policy as a task that must be implemented, policy adoption, which is a state where the public accepts policy as a rule that is needed for the future and the government accepts policy as a task that must be Implemented, strategic readiness, which is a state where the public is ready to implement or be part of policies and bureaucrats are ready to be policy implementers. The last process in the form of strategic readiness includes three readiness, namely organizational, human and environmental aspects.

a) Organizational Aspects

Organizational aspects can be assessed from the mandate in the implementation of policies and implementation plans within the organization that are sufficient including roadmaps and workplans. The mandate in implementing the religious harmony guidance program refers to the Regulation of the Minister of Religious Affairs Number 13 of 2012 concerning the Organization and Work Procedures of Vertical Agencies of the Ministry of Religious Affairs. Head of the Subdivision of Law and Religious Harmony of the Regional Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs of West Java Province, Haidar Yamin Mustafa, SH., MM. says as follows:

"The regulation has a mandate in the form of guiding religious harmony, but there is no executory effort. Because the problem of harmony the solution is dialogue. Law enforcement is not the solution to the problem of harmony" (Interview results on March 4, 2020).

Roadmap and workplan are implementation plans within the organization. Roadmap and workplan are very important to be a reference for the program to be implemented. Head of the Subdivision of Law and Religious Harmony of the Regional Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs of West Java Province, Haidar Yamin Mustafa, SH., MM. It says as follows:

"Our roadmap in 2019 is mapping conflict-prone areas, potential conflict areas, and potential harmony areas" (Interview results on March 4, 2020).

Based on the results of the interview above, it can be seen that the roadmap of the Subdivision of Law and Religious Harmony of the Regional Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs of West Java Province is mapping which is taken through harmony dialogue activities and interfaith dialogue held in 27 regencies/cities and 20 sub-districts spread across West Java.

b) Human Aspect

Human resources in the implementation of this religious harmony guidance program are considered still lacking. Additional resource requirements

Humans in the form of executive staff are intended to reach a wider community, especially in city districts. As stated by the Head of the Subdivision of Law and Religious Harmony of the Regional Office of the Ministry of Religion of West Java Province, Haidar Yamin Mustafa, SH., MM. says as follows:

"In my opinion, regarding human resources, we sometimes still lack personnel in the field. However, there needs to be some kind of special task for the executive staff in the city district, if there is friction and threats that damage harmony, he will play an important role. Therefore, there needs to be some kind of special qualification for harmony analysts or harmony developers in carrying out their duties" (Interview results on March 4, 2020).

Based on the results of the interview, it can be seen that the availability of human resources is far from enough. In addition to personnel limitations, also to find executive staff with specified qualifications is very difficult. The qualification is intended for implementers to be able to solve various problems related to religious harmony in society.

Based on the narration of Drs. H. M. Rafani Achyar M.Si. above, it can be seen that the quality of FKUB human resources is considered good, because not just anyone can join as a member. There are special qualifications required to ensure the capabilities of members so that they are truly qualified in solving internal and inter-religious problems and conflicts in West Java Province. He added that although it is not perfect, at least they are top leaders of religious

organizations, religious assemblies and community organizations so that they have a strong awareness to build harmony in West Java.

Based on the results of the interview above, it can be seen that the quality of human resources related to the ability of implementing religious harmony guidance programs is considered good in terms of broad knowledge about religion, good socializing and negotiating skills and having high motivation in building harmony in West Java.

c) Environmental Aspects

The aspect of environmental readiness is related to two things, first whether the community environment where the policy will be implemented is ready to accept implementation. Second, whether the environment of the government organization where the policy will be implemented is ready to be an implementation partner.

The religious harmony guidance program is supported by community readiness as seen from the enthusiastic community response to the religious harmony guidance program by the Regional Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs of West Java Province. Readiness related to the environment of government organizations can be seen from the establishment of good communication between the Regional Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs of West Java Province and the Forum for Religious Harmony (FKUB) of West Java Province. Good communication is evidenced by the provision of financial assistance to the FKUB of West Java Province and in terms of solving problems of religious harmony. Coordination is also seen in the process of providing recommendations related to the establishment of houses of worship.

4. CONCLUSION

The implementation of the religious harmony guidance program Subdivision of Law and Religious Harmony of the Regional Office of the Ministry of Religious Affairs of West Java Province has not all run effectively based on five right policy effectiveness, namely right policy, implementer, right target, right environment, and right process. The need for improvement in various aspects, especially in terms of regulations that do not yet have special regulations related to Religious Harmony and in terms of procuring standard SOPs so that implementers can have a clear reference in carrying out their duties.

REFERENCES

- Abidin, Zainal Said. (2012). *Kebijakan Publik*. Jakarta: Salemba Humanika. Ahmadi, Rulam. (2014). *Metode Penelitian Kualitatif*. Yogyakarta: Ar-Ruzz Media.
- Arikunto, Suharsimi. (2010). *Prosedur Penelitian Suatu Pendekatan Praktik*. Jakarta: Rineka Cipta.
- Anggara, Sahya. (2014). *Kebijakan Publik*. Bandung: Pustaka Setia.

- Hidayat, Asep dkk. (2017). Reformasi Administrasi Teori dan Aplikasi. Bandung: Fisip UNPAS Press.
- Mahmudi. (2019). Manajemen Kinerja Sektor Publik. Yogyakarta: UPP AMPYKPN.
- Martin, L., dkk. 2014. *Program Effectiveness In A Systematic Process to Facilitate Evidence-Informed Decisionmaking Regarding Program Expansion*. The RAND Toolkit. Vol. 3 (pp. 15-18). RAND Corporation. Retrieved May 4, 2020, from www.jstor.org/stable/10.7249/j.ctt5vjvn4.11 [diakses 4 Mei 2020]
- Moloeng, Ilexy J. (2011). Metode Penelitian Kualitatif. Edisi Revisi. Bandung: Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Nugroho, Riant. (2014). Public Policy. Jakarta: Elex Media Komputindo.
- Santosa, Pandji. (2017). Administrasi Publik Teori dan Aplikasi *Good Governance*. Bandung: Refika Aditama.
- Silalahi, Ulber. (2011). Asas-asas Manajemen. Bandung: Refika Aditama. Sugiyono. (2012). Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif, Kualitatif, dan R&D. Bandung: Alfabeta.
- Suradinata, Ermaya. (2013). *Leadership: How to Build a Nation* Reformasi Organisasi dan Administrasi Pemerintahan. Jakarta: Lembaga Ketahanan Nasional Republik Indonesia.
- Syafii, Kencana Inu. (2019). Sistem Administrasi Negara. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara. Syafri, Wirman. (2012). Studi Tentang Administrasi Publik. Bandung: Gelora Aksara Pratama.
- Winarno, Budi. (2016). Kebijakan Publik di Era Globalisasi. Jakarta: Buku Seru.
- <https://jabar.bps.go.id> [diakses 1 Mei 2020]
- <https://news.detik.com/berita/d-4294492/fpi-pembakar-bendera-tauhid-dihukum-10-hari-menyakitkan-kami> [diakses 27 Januari 2020]
- <https://www.bbc.com/indonesia/indonesia-47849348> [diakses 2 Januari 2020]
- <https://www.bbc.com/indonesia/indonesia-48215796> [diakses 2 Januari 2020]
- <https://www.bbc.com/indonesia/indonesia-50740353> [diakses 2 Januari]